

**Notice of a meeting of  
Corporate Appeals Panel**

**To:** Councillors Cuthbertson, Pavlovic and Wilson  
**Date:** Friday, 13 October 2023  
**Time:** 10.00 am  
**Venue:** The Giles Room - 1st Floor West Offices (F022)

**AGENDA**

**1. Election of Chair**

To elect a Member to act as Chair of the meeting.

**2. Exclusion of Press and Public**

To consider excluding the public and press from the meeting during consideration of agenda item 5 (Appeal against Dismissal) on the grounds that it contains information relating to an individual and information which is likely to reveal the identity of an individual. This information is classified as exempt under paragraphs 1 and 2 of Schedule 12A to Section 100A of the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) Order 2006.

**3. Declarations of Interest**

At this point in the meeting, Members and co-opted members are asked to declare any disclosable pecuniary interest, or other registerable interest, they might have in respect of business on this agenda, if they have not already done so in advance on the Register of Interests. The disclosure must include the nature of the interest.

An interest must also be disclosed in the meeting when it becomes apparent to the member during the meeting.

- (1) *Members must consider their interests, and act according to the following:*

**Type of Interest**

**You must:**

*Disclosable Pecuniary Interests*

*Disclose the interest; not participate in the discussion or vote; and leave the meeting unless you have a dispensation.*

*Other Registrable Interests (Directly Related)*

*Disclose the interest; speak on the item only if the public are also allowed to speak but otherwise not participate in the discussion or vote; and leave the meeting unless you have a dispensation.*

**OR**

*Non-Registrable Interests (Directly Related)*

*Other Registrable Interests (Affects)*

*Disclose the interest; remain in the meeting, participate, and vote unless the matter affects the financial interest or well-being:*

**OR**

*Non-Registrable Interests (Affects)*

*(a) to a greater extent than it affects the financial interests of a majority of inhabitants of the affected ward; and  
(b) a reasonable member of the public knowing all the facts would believe that it would affect your view of the wider public interest,  
in which case speak on the item only if the public are also allowed to speak, but otherwise not do not participate in the discussion or vote, and leave the meeting, unless you have a dispensation.*

- (2) *Disclosable pecuniary interests relate to the Member concerned or their spouse/partner.*

- (3) *Members in arrears of Council Tax by more than two months must not vote in decisions on, or which might affect, budget calculations, and must disclose at the meeting that this restriction applies to them. A failure to comply with these*

*requirements is a criminal offence under section 106 of the Local Government Finance Act 1992.*

**4. Minutes** (Pages 3 - 6)

To approve and sign the minutes of the meeting held on 16 June 2023 and 23 June 2023.

**5. Appeal Against Dismissal**

**a) Appellant's Case** (Pages 7 - 22)

Papers in support of the Appellant's case.

**b) Management Case** (Pages 23 - 58)

Papers in support of management's case.

**c) Joint Supporting Papers** (Pages 59 - 166)

Background papers to the appeal.

Democracy Officer:

Name: Louise Cook

Contact Details:

- Telephone – (01904) 551031
- E-mail - [louise.cook@york.gov.uk](mailto:louise.cook@york.gov.uk)

For more information about any of the following please contact the Democracy Officer responsible for servicing this meeting:

- Registering to speak
- Business of the meeting
- Any special arrangements
- Copies of reports and
- For receiving reports in other formats

Contact details are set out above.

**This information can be provided in your own language.**

**我們也用您們的語言提供這個信息 (Cantonese)**

**এই তথ্য আপনার নিজের ভাষায় দেয়া যেতে পারে। (Bengali)**

**Ta informacja może być dostarczona w twoim  
własnym języku. (Polish)**

**Bu bilgiyi kendi dilinizde almanız mümkündür. (Turkish)**

**یہ معلومات آپ کی اپنی زبان (بولی) میں بھی مہیا کی جاسکتی ہیں۔ (Urdu)**

** (01904) 551550**

**CITY OF YORK COUNCIL**  
**CORPORATE APPEALS PANEL**  
**(Disciplinary Dismissals)**

**Procedure**

The procedure for the appeal will be as follows:

- The appellant and/or his/her representative and the Management (officer(s) appearing for the Council) are invited into the meeting.
- The Chair of the Panel will introduce all parties present and explain procedural matters.
- The Chair will invite the appellant/representative to confirm the reason(s) for the appeal.
- The appellant or his/her representative will present his/her case and will call and question any supporting witnesses he/she considers necessary.
- Following the presentation of the appellant's case, the Chair will invite Management to put questions to the appellant or his/her representative/witnesses.
- Management will present the Council's case and will call and question any supporting witnesses he/she considers necessary.
- Following the presentation of the Council's case, the Chair will invite the appellant/representative to put questions to Management/witnesses.
- Members will ask both parties to sum up (please note that no new evidence can be introduced at this stage)
- Members can ask questions of both parties at any stage during the appeal.

- Any party may call for a reasonable recess during the appeal hearing.
- Once the case for and against the appeal has been heard, the Chair will call for an adjournment for the panel to make their decision.
- Both parties will leave the room while Members, advised by Human Resources, make their decision.

### **Decision**

- Members will debate the case and decide which one or more of the four legal reasons for appeal are applicable.
- Depending on the reason for appeal, Members will decide whether the grounds for appeal are sustained and whether or not to uphold the original decision that the employee did commit a disciplinary offence.
- Members will decide whether or not to uphold the original penalty.
- The reasons for Members decisions will be recorded.
- The outcome of the appeal will be communicated in writing to all parties within five working days of the decision being made.

City of York Council

Minutes

---

Meeting	Corporate Appeals Panel
Date	16 June 2023
Present	Councillors Cuthbertson and Pavlovic
Apologies	Councillor Wilson

---

Prior to the start of the hearing, it was confirmed that all parties were content to proceed with a panel of two Members.

**1. Election of Chair (10:07 am)**

Resolved: That Cllr Pavlovic be elected as Chair of the meeting.

**2. Exclusion of Press and Public (10:08 am)**

Resolved: That the press and public be excluded from the meeting during consideration of Agenda Item 5 (Appeal against Dismissal), on the grounds that it included information relating to an individual and information which was likely to reveal the identity of an individual. This information was classed as exempt under paragraphs 1 and 2 of Schedule 12A to Section 100A of the Local Government Act 1972, as revised by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) Order 2006.

**3. Declarations of Interest (10:09 am)**

Members were asked to declare at this point in the meeting any disclosable pecuniary interests or other registerable interests that they might have in the business on the agenda, if they had not already done so in advance on the Register of Interests.

Although no interests were declared, Cllr Cuthbertson noted that he had previously visited one of the establishments referenced in the agenda pack and had also spoken, in a professional capacity, to one of the employees mentioned.

**4. Minutes (10:11 am)**

Resolved: That the minutes of the meeting held on 19 August 2022 be approved and signed by the Chair as a correct record.

**5. Appeal Against Dismissal (10:12 am)**

The Panel considered an appeal against dismissal under the City of York Council's Disciplinary Procedure.

Having considered the cases presented by the appellant and management and reviewed the information provided in some detail, the Panel determined the outcome of the case relating to the appellant.

Resolved: That the appeal was now concluded and there was no further right of appeal.

Reason: To ensure the Panel meets its procedural requirements in determining appeals.

Chair, Cllr Pavlovic

[The meeting started at 10.03 am and finished at 1.15 pm.]



---

Meeting	Corporate Appeals Panel
Date	23 June 2023
Present	Councillors Cuthbertson, Wilson and J Burton
Apologies	Councillor Pavlovic

---

**6. Election of Chair (1:00 pm)**

Resolved: That Cllr Cutbertson be elected as Chair of the meeting.

**7. Exclusion of Press and Public (1:03 pm)**

Resolved: That the press and public be excluded from the meeting during consideration of Agenda Item 4 (Appeal against Dismissal), on the grounds that it included information relating to an individual and information which was likely to reveal the identity of an individual. This information was classed as exempt under paragraphs 1 and 2 of Schedule 12A to Section 100A of the Local Government Act 1972, as revised by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) Order 2006.

**8. Declarations of Interest (1:05 pm)**

Members were asked to declare at this point in the meeting any disclosable pecuniary interests or other registerable interests that they might have in the business on the agenda, if they had not already done so in advance on the Register of Interests. None were declared.

**9. Appeal Against Dismissal (1:07 pm)**

The Panel considered an appeal against dismissal under the City of York Council's Disciplinary Procedure.

Having considered the cases presented by the appellant and management and reviewed the information provided in some detail, the Panel determined the outcome of the case relating to the appellant.

Resolved: That the appeal was now concluded and there was no further right of appeal.

Reason: To ensure the Panel meets its procedural requirements in determining appeals.

Cllr Cuthbertson, Chair

[The meeting started at 12.55 pm and finished at 4.45 pm.]

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank



By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank



By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank



By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank



By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank



By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank



By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank